

A photograph of a classroom. A teacher in a white shirt and dark pants stands at a whiteboard, pointing. The whiteboard has several educational posters hanging above it, including 'Cause/Effect', 'Criteria', 'Compare', 'Prove', 'Consistent', 'Infer', 'Identify', and 'Label'. A 'DAILY SCHEDULE' poster is also visible. In the foreground, there are wooden desks with papers and a camera on them. A student's arm is visible in the bottom right corner. The floor has a colorful patterned rug.

Big Sky Debate

Resolved: That merit pay based on student achievement should be a significant component of K-12 teacher compensation in United States public schools.



Table of Contents

METADEBATE	3
MERIT PAY DEFINED: A TEACHER-CENTERED MODEL.....	3
LITTLE CONCLUSIVE RESEARCH EXISTS ON MERIT PAY	4
PRO EVIDENCE	8
MERIT PAY GOOD: SHOULD ADOPT A BUSINESS MODEL.....	8
MERIT PAY GOOD: PROVIDES PROOF THAT HIGHER SALARIES ARE WORTH IT	9
MERIT PAY GOOD: TEACHER'S UNIONS CAUSE PROGRAMS TO FAIL, NOT PROGRAM MERIT	10
MERIT PAY GOOD: STUDIES PROVE EFFECTIVENESS IN RAISING STUDENT OUTCOMES	11
MERIT PAY GOOD: EVEN IF STUDENT OUTCOMES DON'T IMPROVE, MERIT PAY INCREASES MORALE.....	17
MERIT PAY GOOD: STUDENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES ARE ACCURATE	18
MERIT PAY GOOD: ATTRACTS BETTER TEACHERS TO SCHOOLS	19
MERIT PAY GOOD: GOOD TEACHERS DESERVE HIGHER SALARIES	21
TRADITIONAL SALARY SCHEDULES FAIL: DOESN'T ATTRACT QUALITY TEACHERS.....	22
TRADITIONAL SALARY SCHEDULES FAIL: DOESN'T REWARD THE BEST TEACHERS.....	23
TRADITIONAL SALARY SCHEDULES FAIL: RESEARCH DOESN'T SUPPORT TRADITIONAL SCALES.....	24
MERIT PAY SUPPORTED: SCHOOL BOARDS SUPPORT	25
MERIT PAY SUPPORTED: DISTRICTS MOVING TOWARD MERIT PAY	26
MERIT PAY SUPPORTED: OBAMA/FEDS SUPPORT.....	29
MERIT PAY SUPPORTED: PUBLIC SUPPORTS	31
A/T: SHOULD BASE MERIT ON EVALUATION	32
A/T: MERIT PAY EMPIRICALLY FAILS	35
CON EVIDENCE	36
MERIT PAY FAILS: MUST STUDY FIRST BEFORE MAKING IT POLICY.....	36
MERIT PAY FAILS: PROGRAM SPECIFICS DOOM ITS IMPLEMENTATION.....	37
MERIT PAY FAILS: POOR DESIGN MAKES MOST MERIT PAY PROGRAMS FAIL	39
MERIT PAY FAILS: TOP DOWN DOESN'T WORK; EACH DISTRICT NEEDS TO DEVELOP ITS OWN SYSTEM.....	40
MERIT PAY FAILS: NOT ALL TEACHERS JUDGED BY TESTING.....	41
MERIT PAY FAILS: PUNISHES TEACHERS FOR UNCONTROLLABLE FACTORS	43
MERIT PAY FAILS: BREEDS DISTRUST AMONG FACULTY MEMBERS	45
MERIT PAY FAILS: IMPOSSIBLE TO JUDGE TEACHER QUALITY	47
MERIT PAY FAILS: MERIT PAY EMPIRICALLY FAILS	50
MERIT PAY FAILS: GOOD TEACHING NOT IMPACTED BY BONUSES	52
MERIT PAY FAILS: REWARDS TEACHERS AT ALREADY AFFLUENT SCHOOLS	54
MERIT PAY FAILS: MODEL ASSUMES UNLIMITED MONEY FOR PAY	57
MERIT PAY FAILS: LEADS TO CHEATING OR FUDGING OF RESULTS	58
MERIT PAY FAILS: DECREASES FOCUS ON CHILDREN	59
MERIT PAY FAILS: HURTS CURRICULUM AND TEACHING	60
MERIT PAY FAILS: SHOULD ONLY BE CONSIDERED ONE TOOL IN REFORM.....	61
MERIT PAY FAILS: RESEARCH SAYS MIXED OR NEGATIVE RESULTS	62
ALTERNATIVE: MERIT PAY ACCORDING TO EVALUATION/COMPREHENSIVE MEASURES.....	63
A/T: SHOULD USE A BUSINESS MODEL IN SCHOOLS.....	68